## STATE OF ILLINOIS

## ILLINOIS COMMERCE COMMISSION

CITIZENS UTILITY BOARD	)
v.	) Docket No. 00-0043
ILLINOIS BELL TELEPHONE CO. (AMERITECH, ILLINOIS)	) )
Complaint to stop Ameritech from using	)
misleading marketing and advertising	)
materials and statements concerning	)
Simplifive and CallPack rates.	)

CONTAINS \*\*\*NON-PROPRIETARY\*\*\* INFORMATION

DIRECT TESTIMONY OF CHARLOTTE F. TERKEURST

ON BEHALF OF THE CITIZENS UTILITY BOARD

MARCH 31, 2000

CITIZENS UTILITY BOARD 208 South LaSalle Street Suite 1760 Chicago, Illinois 60604 Telephone: (312) 263-4282 Fax: (312) 263-4329

CUB Exhibit 1.0

OFFICIAL FILE

I.C.C. DOCKET NO. 00 -0043

CUB Exhibit No. 1. 0

Date 6/1/2012 Reporter

1	I.	INTRODUCTION
2		
3	Q.	PLEASE STATE YOUR NAME, POSITION, AND BUSINESS ADDRESS.
4	A.	My name is Charlotte F. TerKeurst. I am a Senior Vice President of Competitive Strategies
5		Group, Ltd. (CSG). My business address is 70 East Lake Street, 7th Floor, Chicago, Illinois
6		60601.
7		
8	Q.	PLEASE SUMMARIZE YOUR QUALIFICATIONS AND EDUCATIONAL
9		BACKGROUND.
10	A.	I joined CSG in August 1997. I consult primarily on telecommunications issues related to
11		competitive entry, alternative regulation, pricing, numbering, and universal service.
12		Prior to joining CSG, I was employed by the Illinois Commerce Commission (Commission)
13		as Manager of the Telecommunications Division and earlier as Director of the
14		Telecommunications Program in the Office of Policy and Planning. In addition to managing
15		technical staff, I was the lead staff witness in several proceedings, including the
16		Commission's investigation into Ameritech Illinois' compliance with Section 271(c) of the
17		Telecommunications Act of 1996 (the 1996 Act). After passage of the 1996 Act, I spent
18		significant time working with Federal Communications Commission (FCC) and National
19		Association of Regulatory Utility Commissioners representatives on federal and State efforts
20		to implement the new requirements.
21		I was Manager of the Telecommunications Department at the Missouri Public Service
22		Commission in 1991-1993. That Department addressed most aspects of telecommunications
23		regulation in Missouri, including tariff filings, rate design, depreciation, and quality of
24		service oversight.
25		From 1980 until 1991, I was employed by the California Public Utilities Commission, where
26		I held several positions on the technical energy staff, as an advisor to a Commissioner, and
27		as an administrative law judge. As an advisor, I dealt with both energy and
28		telecommunications issues, including state implementation of AT&T's divestiture. As an
29		administrative law judge, I handled telecommunications matters, including cases addressing
30		alternative regulation and intraLATA competition for Pacific Bell Telephone Company and

l		GTE California, and regulatory flexibility for AT&T. For five semesters, I taught a graduate
2		course entitled "Legal and Regulatory Aspects of Telecommunications" at Golden Gate
3		University.
4		I have filed testimony or appeared before commissions in the states of California, Colorado,
5		Illinois, Indiana, Kentucky, Missouri, Ohio, Puerto Rico, Rhode Island, and Texas. I hold a
6		Bachelor of Science degree in mathematics from the University of Mississippi and a Master
7		of Science degree in electrical engineering from the University of Illinois at Champaign-
8		Urbana. I have also taken
9		engineering and economics courses at the Los Angeles and Berkeley campuses of the
0		University of California. A detailed description of my qualifications and experience is
1		attached to my testimony as Attachment 1.
12		
13	Q.	ON WHOSE BEHALF ARE YOU TESTIFYING IN THIS PROCEEDING?
14	A.	I am presenting testimony on behalf of the Citizens Utility Board (CUB).
15		
6	Q.	WHAT IS THE PURPOSE OF YOUR TESTIMONY?
17	A.	The purpose of my testimony is threefold. First, I evaluate whether residential consumers
8		experience savings under the SimpliFive and CallPack plans as suggested by Ameritech
19		Illinois. Second, I address the importance of fair advertising and marketing practices to ensure
20		that customers can make informed choices among the various calling plans available to them.
21		Third, I address the harm to competition that can arise due to Ameritech Illinois' unreasonable
22		advertising and marketing practices.
23		
24	Q.	PLEASE SUMMARIZE YOUR TESTIMONY AND RECOMMENDATIONS IN THIS
25		PROCEEDING.
26	A.	In this testimony, I demonstrate that, contrary to Ameritech Illinois' marketing assertions,
27		most residential customers will pay more under the SimpliFive and CallPack plans
28		compared to Ameritech Illinois' basic rates. I also demonstrate that Ameritech Illinois
29		misrepresents the SimpliFive and CallPack plans to customers and leads them to believe that
30		they will save money under those plans when in reality they will not. Ameritech Illinois'
31	•	deceptive advertising and marketing practices not only prevent customers from making

informed choices among Ameritech Illinois' various calling options, but also harm 1 2 competition in the local and intraLATA toll markets. In order to address the harms inflicted on customers and competition due to Ameritech Illinois' 3 deceptive advertising and marketing practices, Ameritech Illinois should be required to modify 4 these practices in several respects. At a minimum, Ameritech Illinois should be required to: 5 Provide customers with the information they need in order to make informed 6 choices regarding the desirability of these plans, including a clear explanation 7 during marketing activities that the customer's calling patterns will affect the 8 rates paid under the marketed plan and that lower-priced options may be 9 available, 10 11 12 During marketing activities, offer to provide information about other Ameritech Illinois rate options and offer to do a customer-specific billing 13 comparison using available historical usage data or anticipated usage 14 15 patterns, 16 Offer the SimpliFive and CallPack options to customers only after it has 17 offered to provide the additional information addressed above, 18 19 Provide SimpliFive and CallPack subscribers with on-going information 20 21 about their usage, including itemized monthly bills. 22 23 Provide customers information annually about all Ameritech Illinois rates and plans available to them in order to allow customers to evaluate, over time, 24 whether particular calling plans are indeed beneficial to them, and 25 26 27 Fund a consumer education campaign through the print and electronic media and bill inserts to educate consumers about Ameritech's basic rates, ways 28 they can control their telephone costs, the availability of calling plans and the 29 30 existence of competition for some services. 31 32 Finally, because of the higher rates that Ameritech Illinois has charged SimpliFive and CallPack customers as a result of its unreasonable marketing practices, 33 Ameritech Illinois should be required to refund overcharges to those customers. 34 Ameritech Illinois should be required to report the total amount of overcharges to the 35 Commission. In assessing such overcharges, Ameritech Illinois should be instructed 36 37 not to net against the overcharges any savings that other SimpliFive and CallPack

subscribers may have realized.

38

39

## II. ANALYSIS OF WHETHER SIMPLIFIVE AND CALLPACK PLANS PROVIDE SAVINGS TO AMERITECH ILLINOIS' RESIDENTIAL CUSTOMERS

3

- Q. PLEASE SUMMARIZE YOUR ASSESSMENT OF WHETHER AMERITECH
   ILLINOIS' SIMPLIFIVE AND CALLPACK PLANS PROVIDE SAVINGS TO
   RESIDENTIAL CUSTOMERS.
- A. Based on the information available about customers' aggregate calling patterns, most residential customers would pay higher rates under both the SimpliFive and CallPack 100 plans compared to Ameritech Illinois' basic rates.

10

- 11 Q. PLEASE PROVIDE YOUR UNDERSTANDING OF AMERITECH ILLINOIS'
  12 BASIC RATES FOR ITS RESIDENTIAL BAND A, <sup>1</sup> B<sup>2</sup> AND C<sup>3</sup> SERVICES.
- 13 A. Ameritech Illinois' current basic rates for MSA 1 are as follows:<sup>4</sup>

14	Band	Peak <sup>5</sup>	Shoulder Peak <sup>6</sup>	Off Peak <sup>7</sup>
15	Α	\$0.05/call	\$0.045/call	\$0.03/call
16	В	\$0.05/1 <sup>st</sup> min	\$0.045/1 <sup>st</sup> min	\$0.03/1 <sup>st</sup> min
17		\$0.015/add min	\$0.0135/add min	\$0.009/add min
18	C	\$0.010/min	\$0.10/min	\$0.10/min

19

In addition to the above mentioned rates, residential customers receive an increasing discount for Band A and B services based on total accumulated monthly usage for those services. Specifically, for Band A and B usage between \$2.61 and \$5.20, a 15% discount applies. For usage between \$5.21 and \$10.40, a 20% discount usage

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Band A calls are carried over a distance of 0 to 8 miles from the central office.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Band B calls are carried over a distance of 8 to 15 miles from the central office.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Band C calls are carried over a distance of 15 miles or more from the central office.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> ILL.C.C. No. 20, Part 4, Section 2, 6<sup>th</sup> Revised Sheet No. 83.1, Subsection 4.4A(1).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Peak hours are 9am to 11 am and 2pm to 8 pm, Monday through Friday.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Shoulder Peak hours are from 8am to 9 am, 11am to 2 pm and 8pm to 9pm, Monday through Friday.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Off Peak hours are 9pm to 8 am, Monday through Friday, and 9 pm Friday through 8 am Monday.

1		applies. For	usage between \$10.41	and \$26, a 24% discount appli	es. Finally, for
2		usage levels	over \$26.01, a 33% di	scount applies.	
3		Ameritech Ill	inois' current basic re	sidential rates for MSAs other t	than MSA 1 are as
4		follows:8			
5		Band	Peak	Shoulder Peak	Off Peak
6		A	\$0.056/call	\$0.0504/call	\$0.03/call
. 7		В	\$0.05/1 <sup>st</sup> min	\$0.045/1 <sup>st</sup> min	\$0.03/1 <sup>st</sup> min
8			\$0.017/add min	\$0.0153/add min	\$0.012/add min
9		C	\$0.010/min	\$0.10/min	\$0.10/min
10					
11		In addition to	the above mentioned	rates, residential customers rec	eive the same
12		increasing dis	scounts on Band A and	d B services available in MSA	1, i.e., a 15%
13		discount for u	sage exceeding \$2.60	increasing in three additional s	steps to a 33%
14		discount for u	isage over \$26.00 as d	lescribed above.	
15					
16	Q.	HOW MANY	RESIDENTIAL LIN	IES ARE CURRENTLY BILL	ED AT
17		AMERITECI	I ILLINOIS' BASIC I	RATES?	
18	A.	As of Februar	y 2000, there were **	***residential lines	being billed at
19		Ameritech III	inois' basic rates.9		
20					
21	Q.	PLEASE PRO	OVIDE YOUR UNDE	ERSTANDING OF AMERITE	CH ILLINOIS'
22		RATES FOR	RESIDENTIAL BAN	ND A, B AND C SERVICES U	NDER THE
23		SIMPLIFIVE	PLAN.		
24	A.	According to	Ameritech Illinois' tar	riff, the SimpliFive plan prices	Ameritech Illinois'
25		Band A service	ce at \$0.05/call, and it	s Band B and C services at \$0.0	)5/minute, 24
26		hours a day, 7	days per week. In ad	ldition, residential customers re	ceive a 15%

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> ILL.C.C. No. 20, Part 4, Section 2, 6<sup>th</sup> Revised Sheet No. 754.1, Subsection 5.4A(1) and ILL.C.C. No. 19, Part 4, Section 2, 3<sup>rd</sup> Revised Sheet No. 38, Subsection 3.4A(2).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Ameritech Illinois response to CUB data requests 8 and 9.

1		discount for Band A, B and C usage exceeding \$15 but less than \$30, and a 30%
2		discount for usage exceeding \$30.
3		
4	Q.	HOW MANY RESIDENTIAL LINES ARE CURRENTLY BILLED AT
5		AMERITECH ILLINOIS' SIMPLIFIVE RATES?
6	A.	As of February 2000, there were *** *** residential lines being billed at
7		Ameritech Illinois' SimpliFive rates. 10
8		
9	Q.	PLEASE PROVIDE YOUR UNDERSTANDING OF AMERITECH ILLINOIS'
10		RATES FOR RESIDENTIAL BAND A, B AND C SERVICES UNDER THE
11		CALLPACK PLANS.
12	A.	Ameritech Illinois has four different CallPack plans, namely CallPack 100, CallPack
13		250, CallPack 400 and CallPack 800. Under CallPack 100, a customer pays a flat
14		rate of \$10 for a monthly calling allowance of 100 Band A, B and/or C calls during
15		that month. If the customer makes 100 Band A, B and/or C calls during that month,
16		the effective rate for those calls is \$0.10/call. The customer is charged \$0.10 per call
17		for each Band A, B or C call over the 100 monthly calling allowance.
18		Under CallPack 250, a customer pays a flat rate of \$20 for a monthly calling
19		allowance of 250 Band A, B and/or C calls during that month. If the customer
20		makes 250 calls during that month, the effective rate per call for the customer's Band
21		A, B and C calls is \$0.08/call. The customer is charged \$0.09 per call for each Band
22		A, B or C call over the 250 monthly calling allowance. This plan was grandfathered
23		by Ameritech Illinois on July 3, 1998. <sup>11</sup>
24		Under CallPack 400, a customer pays a flat rate of \$30 for a monthly calling
25		allowance of 400 Band A, B and/or C calls during that month. If the customer
26		makes 400 calls during that month, the effective rate per call for the customer's Band
27		A, B and C calls is \$0.075/call. The customer is charged \$0.08 for each Band A, B,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Ameritech Illinois response to CUB data request 6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Ameritech Illinois response to CUB data request 5.

1		or C call over the 400 monthly calling allowance. This plan was grandfathered by
2		Ameritech Illinois on July 3, 1998. <sup>12</sup>
3		Under CallPack 800, a customer pays a flat rate of \$60 for a monthly calling
4		allowance of 800 Band A, B and/or C calls during that month. If the customer
5		makes 400 calls during that month, the effective rate per call for the customer's Band
6		A, B and C calls is \$0.075/call. The customer is charged \$0.08 for each Band A, B
7		or C call over the 800 monthly calling allowance. This plan was grandfathered by
8		Ameritech Illinois on July 3, 1998. 13
9		
10	Q.	HOW MANY RESIDENTIAL LINES ARE CURRENTLY BILLED AT
11		AMERITECH ILLINOIS' CALLPACK RATES?
12	A.	As of February 2000, the numbers of residential lines billed at the CallPack 100, 250
13		400 and 800 rates were *** ***, *** , *** *** and *** ***
14		respectively. 14
15		
16	A.	Analysis of Whether SimpliFive Rates Provide Savings to Ameritech Illinois'
17		Residential Customers
18		
19	Q.	HOW DO SIMPLIFIVE RATES COMPARE TO AMERITECH ILLINOIS' BASIC
20		RATES IN MSA 1?
21	A.	In MSA 1, SimpliFive's Band A and B rates are equal to or greater than Ameritech
22		Illinois' basic Band A and B rates regardless of the volume or time of the call.
23		SimpliFive's Band C rates are half of Ameritech Illinois' basic Band C rates.
24		However, Ameritech Illinois' basic rates offer volume discounts that are generally
25		larger than those applicable under the SimpliFive plan.
26		

12 <u>Id.</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> <u>Id.</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Ameritech Illinois response to CUB data request 7.

- Q. PLEASE EVALUATE THE IMPACT ON MSA 1 RESIDENTIAL CUSTOMERS
  OF SUBSCRIBING TO THE SIMPLIFIVE PLAN AS OPPOSED TO
  REMAINING ON AMERITECH ILLINOIS' BASIC RATES.
- Based on data provided by Ameritech Illinois, the typical residential customer has 4 relatively high Band A (i.e., untimed calling) calling levels (80% of total Band A, B 5 and C calls)<sup>15</sup> and relatively low Band B (12% of total Band A, B and C calls)<sup>16</sup> and 6 Band C calls (8% of total Band A, B and C calls). <sup>17</sup> Since Band A and B calls are 7 more expensive under SimpliFive than under Ameritech Illinois' basic rates, MSA 1 8 customers with this average Band A/B/C calling pattern pay more under SimpliFive 9 than they would if they use Ameritech Illinois' basic rates. 10 This conclusion is illustrated in Attachments 2, 3 and 4 attached hereto for three total 11 usage levels. Attachment 2 illustrates rates for a customer with 30 Band A calls per 12 week. Attachments 3 and 4 illustrate customers with low (9 Band A calls per week) 13 and high (90 Band A calls per week) usage levels. In the absence of Ameritech 14 Illinois-specific data regarding residential time-of-day calling patterns, 18 I assume a 15 residential time-of-day calling pattern in which 75% of calls are during 16 17 Peak/Shoulder Peak periods and 25% are during Off Peak periods, based on my experience in the telecommunications industry. For simplicity, I also develop a 18 composite Band A basic rate for the Peak/Shoulder Peak period of \$0.0484 per call. 19 19 20 Similarly, I develop composite Band B basic rates for the Peak/Shoulder Peak period

of \$0.0484 for the initial minute and \$0.0145 for each additional minute. As

Attachments 2, 3 and 4 demonstrate, residential customers in MSA 1 within this

21

22

Ameritech Illinois response to CUB data requests 21, 22, 23 and 24.

<sup>16 &</sup>lt;u>Id.</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Id.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> CUB has requested time-of-day usage data from Ameritech Illinois. If Ameritech Illinois-specific data is obtained, the analyses in Exhibits 2 through 7 could be refined accordingly.

According to Ameritech Illinois' tariffs, there are twice as many Peak hours per week (40 hours) as there are Shoulder Peak hours (20 hours). As a result, the Peak/Shoulder Peak rate is developed as follows: (\$0.05\*67%)+(\$0.045\*33%)=\$0.0484.

I		wide range of total usage levels and with average Band A/B/C calling patterns will
2		always pay more under SimpliFive than under basic rates.
3		Since SimpliFive's Band C rates are less than basic Band C rates, customers with
4		disproportionate amounts of Band C calling may find the SimpliFive plan to be
5		advantageous. I have calculated that customers with average total usage levels but
6		with Band C calls totaling about 11% or more of their total Band A, B and C calls
7		would find the SimpliFive plan financially attractive. While I do not have the data to
8		determine exactly how many residential customers show such disproportionate Band
9		C calling patterns, it is clear that the majority of customers in MSA 1 would
10		experience rate increases if they subscribe to the SimpliFive plan.
11		
12	Q.	HOW DO SIMPLIFIVE RATES COMPARE TO AMERITECH ILLINOIS' BASIC
13		RATES IN MSAS OTHER THAN MSA 1?
14	A.	Like MSA 1, SimpliFive's Band C rate is half the basic Band C rate. In addition,
15		SimpliFive rates are slightly less than the basic undiscounted Peak and Shoulder
16		Peak rates for Band A calls and are equal to the rate for the initial minute of Peak
17		Band B calls. SimpliFive rates are higher than all other basic rate elements. In
18		addition, Ameritech Illinois' basic rates include volume discounts that are larger than
19		those applicable under the SimpliFive plan. These larger volume discounts
20		progressively reduce the basic Peak and Shoulder Peak Band A rates and the Peak
21		Band B rates below those offered under the SimpliFive plan.
22		
23	Q.	PLEASE EVALUATE THE IMPACT ON NON-MSA 1 RESIDENTIAL
24		CUSTOMERS OF SUBSCRIBING TO THE SIMPLIFIVE PLAN AS OPPOSED
25		TO REMAINING ON AMERITECH ILLINOIS' BASIC RATES.
26	A.	Attachments 5, 6 and 7 analyze the impact in MSAs other than MSA 1 on residential
27		customers with average Band A/B/C calling patterns of subscribing to the SimpliFive
28		plan compared to remaining on basic rates. As demonstrated for the three total usage
29		levels in these Attachments, non-MSA 1 customers with average Band A/B/C calling
30		patterns will always be better off remaining on Ameritech Illinois' basic rates.
31		Similar to MSA 1, only customers with Band C calls that are 12% or more of

Ţ	their	total Band A, B and C calls would find the Simplifive plan financially attractive.
2		
3	Q.	WHAT IS YOUR CONCLUSION REGARDING THIS MATTER?
4		A. Based on the information available about customers' aggregate calling
5		patterns, most residential customers would pay higher rates under the
6		SimpliFive plan compared to Ameritech Illinois' basic rates.
7		
8		B. Analysis of Whether CallPack Rates Provide Savings to Ameritech Illinois'
9		Residential Customers
10		
11	Q.	PLEASE IDENTIFY WHICH CALLPACK PLANS YOU ANALYZE IN THIS
12		PORTION OF YOUR TESTIMONY.
13	A.	I limit my analysis to CallPack 100 because the other CallPack options have been
14		grandfathered and, thus, Ameritech Illinois is not marketing them at this time.
15		
16	Q.	HOW DO CALLPACK 100 RATES COMPARE TO AMERITECH ILLINOIS'
17		BASIC RATES?
18	A.	Both within and outside MSA 1, the \$0.10/call CallPack 100 rate is significantly
19		more expensive than Ameritech Illinois' basic untimed Band A rates. The CallPack
20		100 rate is lower than Ameritech Illinois' basic undiscounted rates for Band B calls
21		longer than about 4 to 9 minutes, depending on the time of day, and is lower than th
22		undiscounted basic rates for all Band C calls over 1 minute. However, Ameritech
23		Illinois' basic rates include a large volume discount while CallPack 100 rates do not
24		
25	Q.	PLEASE EVALUATE THE IMPACT ON RESIDENTIAL CUSTOMERS OF
26		SUBSCRIBING TO THE CALLPACK 100 PLAN AS OPPOSED TO
27		REMAINING ON AMERITECH ILLINOIS' BASIC RATES.
28	A.	Attachments 2 through 7 demonstrate that residential customers with average Band
29		A/B/C calling patterns and with average call lengths (holding times), within and
30		outside MSA 1, will consistently pay higher rates if they subscribe to Ameritech
31		Illinois' CallPack 100 service as opposed to remaining on basic rates. I have

1		calculated that customers will experience savings under the Cantrack 100 plan only
2		if their Band B and Band C calls are, on average, about 50 percent longer than
3		average call lengths. Ameritech Illinois data indicate that, while CallPack
4		subscription levels have increased to about *** *** percent of Ameritech Illinois'
5		residential customers, 20 average call lengths have been stable in Band C and have
6		increased only slightly in Band B.21 Therefore, while I do not have the data to
7		determine exactly how many residential customers make Band B and C calls that are
8		long enough so that CallPack 100 would save them money, it is clear that the
9		majority of residential customers would experience rate increases if they subscribe to
10		the CallPack 100 plan.
11		
12	III.	IMPLICATIONS OF RATE ANALYSIS ON NEED FOR CUSTOMER
13		EDUCATION AND FAIR MARKETING PRACTICES
14		
15	Q.	WHY IS IT IMPORTANT FOR AMERITECH ILLINOIS TO UTILIZE FAIR
16		MARKETING PRACTICES WHEN INFORMING CUSTOMERS ABOUT ITS
17		VARIOUS CALLING PLANS?
18	A.	As I described in the previous section, many customers will have higher bills if they
19		subscribe to the SimpliFive and CallPack plans. While some customers may choose
20		to pay higher rates in return for the simpler rate structures of these plans, it is
21		imperative that Ameritech Illinois fully disclose this potential for higher rates so that
22		customers can make informed choices among Ameritech Illinois' various calling
23		options.
24		
25		
26		
27		

Ameritech Illinois responses to CUB data requests 6, 7, 8 and 9.

 $<sup>^{21}\,\,</sup>$  Ameritech Illinois responses to CUB data requests 25, 2.1 and 2.2.

1	Q.	HAVE YOU REVIEWED THE MARKETING AND CUSTOMER
2		SOLICITATION MATERIALS, RESEARCH RESULTS, TRAINING MANUALS
3		AND TELEPHONE SCRIPTS PROVIDED BY AMERITECH ILLINOIS IN
4		RESPONSE TO CUB'S DATA REQUESTS REGARDING THE SIMPLIFIVE
5		AND CALLPACK PLANS?
6	A.	Yes, I have.
7		
8	Q.	HOW HAS AMERITECH ILLINOIS REPRESENTED SIMPLIFIVE AND
9		CALLPACK PLANS TO RESIDENTIAL CUSTOMERS?
10	A.	Based on my review of the materials submitted by Ameritech Illinois, and as
11		discussed by CUB witness Ms. Bayard, Ameritech Illinois claims that customers will
12		experience savings <sup>22</sup> in addition to simpler rate structures <sup>23</sup> under the SimpliFive and
13		CallPack plans compared to what would occur if they purchased those services from
14		Ameritech Illinois under its basic rates or from a competitor.
15		
16	Q.	DOES AMERITECH ILLINOIS ACCURATELY REPRESENT THE COSTS AND
17		BENEFITS ASSOCIATED WITH SUBSCRIBING TO ITS SIMPLIFIVE AND
18		CALLPACK PLANS AS OPPOSED TO REMAINING ON ITS BASIC RATES?
19	A.	No, it does not. In discussing the SimpliFive and CallPack plans with customers,
20		Ameritech Illinois fails to inform customers that the discount schedule associated
21		with its basic rates provides larger volume discounts than those available under the
22		SimpliFive plan. Further, Ameritech Illinois fails to inform customers that these
23		plans will increase their combined Bands A, B and C usage charges unless, for
24		SimpliFive, they consume a disproportionate amount of Band C service or, for
25		CallPack 100, they make Band B and Band C calls that are significantly longer than
26		average call lengths.
27		

Ameritech Illinois response to CUB data request 11, Exhibits 1 and 3, Ameritech Illinois response to CUB data request 12, Exhibit 5-15, Ameritech Illinois response to CUB data request 15, Ameritech Illinois response to CUB data request 18, Toll-Lesson 11, Winback Procedures at 12.

Ameritech Illinois response to CUB data request 11, Exhibits 1, 2 and 3, Ameritech Illinois response to CUB data request 12, Exhibit 5-15, Ameritech Illinois response to CUB data request 15, Exhibits 17 and 18.

1 Q. DOES AMERITECH ILLINOIS MARKET SIMPLIFIVE TO CUSTOMERS WHO 2 IT KNOWS WILL EXPERIENCE HIGHER RATES UNDER SIMPLIFIVE? Yes. Ameritech Illinois has indicated that it targets customers who could experience 3 A. a net increase or decrease in their monthly bills of \$3.<sup>24</sup> Ameritech Illinois instructs 4 its customer service representatives that "customers prefer simplicity over savings"25 5 6 and that "many customers enjoy a simple plan and are willing to spend a couple dollars more for SimpliFive."<sup>26</sup> even though Ameritech Illinois' own customer survey 7 indicates that 65% of customers value savings over simplicity.<sup>27</sup> Ameritech Illinois' 8 9 instructions would tend to encourage customer service representatives to market the plan to customers who would not experience savings under the plan. Moreover, 10 Ameritech Illinois' marketing materials instruct customer service representatives that 11 \*\*\* 12 .\*\*\*"28 However, as I just 13 explained, residential customers with such calling patterns will not experience 14 15 savings under the SimpliFive plan. Ameritech Illinois instructs customer service representatives to market the 16 SimpliFive plan even when the customer service representative knows that the 17 18 customer would save money under Ameritech Illinois' basic rates, i.e., when data on the representative's screen indicates that basic rates are the "best plan" for the 19 customer.<sup>29</sup> In that situation, customer service representatives are instructed to 20 21 reference basic rates without actually identifying their levels, followed by a detailed

22

23

listing of SimpliFive rates and a statement that it provides "a simplified rate

structure". If customers request a cost comparison, customer service representatives

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Ameritech Illinois response to CUB data request 14, Exhibit 19 at 1.

<sup>25</sup> Id.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Ameritech Illinois response to CUB data request 18, Exhibit 22, "Do you want simple pricing?"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Ameritech Illinois response to CUB data request 13A&B, Exhibit 16 at 11.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Ameritech Illinois response to CUB data request 18, Products and Services – Lesson 9, Local Service Options and Optional Calling Plans at 13.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Ameritech Illinois response to CUB data request 14, Exhibit 19, Do you want simple pricing?

1		are instructed to state that, *** "
2		"*** a statement that is incorrect for most customers, as I have
3		explained. The marketing script specifies that customer service representatives are
4		to provide a customer-specific cost comparison of SimpliFive and basic rates
5		***
6		*** <sup>30</sup>
7		
8	Q.	IN YOUR ASSESSMENT, DO AMERITECH ILLINOIS'
9		MISREPRESENTATIONS ABOUT THE SIMPLIFIVE AND CALLPACK PLANS
0		PROVIDE CUSTOMERS WITH A REASONABLE OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE
11		INFORMED CHOICES?
12	A.	No, they do not. Ameritech Illinois' omission of critical information, including a
13		complete rate comparison between the SimpliFive plan and basic rates and an
14		explanation of the impact of calling patterns on rates, deprives customers of the
15		ability to make informed choices among Ameritech Illinois' various calling plans.
16		Further, Ameritech Illinois' active marketing of the SimpliFive and CallPack plans as
17		ways to save money, even to customers who Ameritech Illinois knows would not
8		benefit from the plan, is unfair and deceptive. Such improper marketing practices
19		should not be tolerated, especially in a regulated company.
20		
21	Q.	DO YOU HAVE ADDITIONAL CONCERNS REGARDING AMERITECH
22		ILLINOIS' PRACTICES AS THEY RELATE TO THE SIMPLIFIVE AND
23		CALLPACK PLANS?
24	A.	Yes. Based on the training materials provided by Ameritech Illinois to its customer
25		service representatives, it appears that Ameritech Illinois instructs its representatives
26		to activate a CallPack plan on a customer's account so that the plan goes into effect
27		within one <sup>31</sup> to two <sup>32</sup> days. However, when a customer seeks to terminate a CallPack

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> <u>Id.</u>

<sup>31</sup> Ameritech Illinois response to CUB data request 18, Toll-Handout 9 at 15 and 17.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Ameritech Illinois response to CUB data request 18, Toll-Lesson 11, Winback procedures at 17.

plan from his/her account, the representative is instructed to due date the order for the day before the next bill date.<sup>33</sup> Such treatment confines the customer to the CallPack plan longer than is necessary and may result in a customer bill that is higher than it would have been had the customer been taken off the CallPack plan within a day or two of his/her request. Ameritech Illinois should be required to implement customers changes as soon as practicable and not in a manner, as it does with CallPack plans, which maximizes its revenues during a given billing cycle.

8

## IV. IMPACTS ON COMPETITION

10

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

- 11 Q. DO YOU HAVE CONCERNS REGARDING THE IMPACT OF AMERITECH
  12 ILLINOIS' SIMPLIFIVE AND CALLPACK PLANS ON COMPETITION FOR
  13 TELECOMMUNICATIONS SERVICES IN ILLINOIS?
- 14 A. Yes, I do. Ameritech Illinois represents to customers that rates for bundled Band A,
  15 B and C calling through the SimpliFive or CallPack plans will be lower than they
  16 would be if the customer purchased each type of calling individually from Ameritech
  17 Illinois or a competitor.

For those areas where competition for residential Band A and B usage services has not yet developed, creating the misperception that Band A and B usage rates are more favorable under a bundled offering than when purchased individually from Ameritech Illinois under basic rates threatens the development of competition in the intraLATA toll market. This is because customers are led to believe that selecting a service provider other than Ameritech Illinois for intraLATA toll service will increase the prices for Band A and B usage services they must purchase from Ameritech Illinois. As explained above, residential customers make predominantly Band A calls.<sup>34</sup> As a result, customers will view the threat of increases in their

Ameritech Illinois response to CUB data request 18, Toll-Handout 9 at 15 and 17.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> See also, Ameritech Illinois response to CUB data request 18, SimpliFive Handout.

1		monopoly-provided Band A rates as a deterrent to selecting a service provider other
2		than Ameritech Illinois for intraLATA toll service.
3		
4	Q.	DO YOU HAVE CONCERNS REGARDING AMERITECH ILLINOIS'
5		REPRESENTATIONS ABOUT THE SIMPLIFIVE AND CALLPACK PLANS IN
6		ITS EFFORTS TO "WINBACK" CUSTOMERS WHO HAVE SUBSCRIBED TO
7		OTHER CARRIERS?
8	A.	Yes, I do. Ameritech Illinois has specific marketing efforts aimed at "winning back"
9		customers who have presubscribed to another carrier for intraLATA toll service.
10		Specifically, within a few days after a customer selects an alternative intraLATA toll
11		provider, Ameritech Illinois *** "*** stating, ir
12		part, "Since we know many customers have been switched without their permission,
13		we want to be sure you know how to reach us if this was not approved by you."35 If
14		the customer contacts Ameritech Illinois in response to this ***"
15		
16		*** <sup>36</sup>
17		I have two concerns about these practices. First, Ameritech Illinois' disparaging
18		statements raise doubts about the legitimacy of the activities of its intraLATA toll
19		competitors and necessarily shed a negative light on those competitors, thereby
20		harming their credibility with customers. These statements may also discourage a
21		customer from remaining with a competitor even if the switch was authorized by the
22		customer.
23		Second, Ameritech Illinois' offer to win back customers through offering the
24		SimpliFive and CallPack plans without fully informing customers about basic rate
25		alternatives again creates the misperception that Simplifive and CallPack plans are
26		priced more favorably than Ameritech Illinois' basic rates for Bands A and B usage.
27		It also creates the misperception that selection of another service provider for
28		intraLATA toll service, with the customer thereby being ineligible for the SimpliFive
29		and CallPack plans, will increase rates for the Band A and B usage services they

<sup>35</sup> Ameritech Illinois response to CUB data request 12-A, Exhibit 4.

1		must purchase from Ameritech Illinois. Since residential customers make
2		predominantly Band A calls, a perceived increase in Band A rateswhether well
3		founded or notwill act to deter a customer from selecting an intraLATA toll
4		provider other than Ameritech Illinois.
5		
6	Q.	DO YOU HAVE OTHER CONCERNS REGARDING THE IMPACT ON
7		COMPETITION OF AMERITECH ILLINOIS' PRACTICES UNDER THE
8		SIMPLIFIVE AND CALLPACK PLANS?
9	A.	Yes, I do. On customers' bills, Ameritech Illinois does not itemize the Band A, B
10		and C calls for SimpliFive and CallPack plans. Instead, Ameritech Illinois provides
11		a single total charge for all calls billed on a per call basis and a separate total charge
12		for all calls billed on a per minute basis under the plans. This limited information
13		precludes customers from being able to adequately review their calling patterns and
14		rates to determine whether they would benefit from a change in their calling patterns,
15		calling plans and/or service providers.
16		
17	Q.	WHAT IS YOUR CONCLUSION WITH REGARD TO THE IMPACT OF
18		AMERITECH ILLINOIS' REPRESENTATIONS ABOUT ITS SIMPLIFIVE AND
19		CALLPACK PLANS ON COMPETITION FOR LOCAL AND INTRALATA
20		TOLL SERVICE?
21	A.	For the reasons I have discussed, I conclude that Ameritech Illinois'
22		misrepresentations about its SimpliFive and CallPack plans have an adverse effect on
23		competition in the local and intraLATA toll markets.
24		
25	<b>V.</b>	RECOMMENDATIONS
26		
27	Q.	WHAT RECOMMENDATIONS DO YOU MAKE AS A RESULT OF YOUR
28		CONCERNS REGARDING AMERITECH ILLINOIS' SIMPLIFIVE AND CALLPACK
29		PRACTICES?

<sup>36</sup> Ameritech Illinois response to CUB data request 14, Illinois Calling Plans matrix.